



# EMPLOYMENT TRIBUNALS

BETWEEN

**Claimant**

Mr A Doughty & Others  
(complete schedule of claimants annexed)

**AND**

**Respondent**

R1. Phones 4U Ltd (In Administration)  
R2. The Secretary of State for BEIS

**HELD AT** Birmingham (In Chambers)

**ON** 9 & 10 January 2017

**EMPLOYMENT JUDGE** Lloyd

**Appearances**

**For the Claimants:** Mr A Doughty, In Person/Lay Representative  
(in writing) Mr D Kindell, Solicitor  
Ms S Lowey, In Person/Lay Representative

**For the Respondents:** R1. Solicitors off record; defence suspended  
R2 Appearance by correspondence

## JUDGMENT

**(IN CHAMBERS)**

The judgment of the Employment Judge sitting alone is that:

- 1) In this Judgment “the claimants” means those listed in the Schedules at Part 1 (A) & Part 2 of the Annex hereto. The claimants so named are the only remaining active claimants to these proceedings
- 2) The claimants were employed by the first respondent and were among some 3,358 or so employees who were dismissed as redundant between 19 September 2014 and 9 March 2015. The respondent went into Administration on 15 September 2014. The administrator has consented to these claims proceeding.
- 3) I declare that the complaint that the respondent failed to comply with the requirements of section 188 of the Trade Union and Labour Relations (Consolidation) Act 1992 is well founded.
- 4) I make a protective award in respect of all the claimants and order the first respondent to pay to each of the claimants’ remuneration for the protected period of 90 days beginning on 19 September 2014 irrespective of the actual date of termination of employment. The first respondent is insolvent and the awards are subject to the provisions of Part X11 Employment Rights Act 1996 (“ERA”) and

the insolvency obligations of the second respondent; in particular under s.184 ERA.

- 5) I make an order for costs; to the extent that each group of claimants shall be entitled to recover their group tribunal issue fee namely the figure shown in the right hand column of the table at part 1 (B) of the Annex. The live claims fall into 5 different fee groups. Each group has paid one issue fee only.
- 6) The claimants shown in the schedule at part 2 of the Annex withdrew their duplicate claims in November 2015 with the exceptions of Ms Farhana Choudhury, Ms Lauren Smith, Ms Samantha Francis and Mr Adam Jones. All of the claimants in part 2 of the annex remain active.

## **REASONS**

### **Background**

- 1) The claimants pursue claims for protective awards only. The second respondent (SoS) has previously received claims from former employees of the first respondent (P4U) and payments have been made from the National Insurance Fund in respect of various claims including redundancy pay, compensatory notice pay, arrears of wages and holiday pay.
- 2) P4U was a business engaged in the selling of mobile phone network connections, handsets, accessories and mobile phone insurance to retail customers. P4U entered into administration on 15 September 2014. On 19 September 2014 623 employees were made redundant from Head Office. On 22 September 2014 1,683 employees were made redundant from retail stores, including 21 at the Merry Hill Shopping Centre store ("Merry Hill"). The remaining employees in this action were made redundant on various dates up to 8 December 2014; thus within a period of 90 days.
- 3) A large number of other redundancies were then made between 30 September 2014 and 9 March 2015.
- 4) A list of redundancy dates prepared by the first respondent's administrators is at Part 3 of the Annex hereto.
- 5) At a preliminary hearing held on 25-28 April 2016 before Employment Judge Findlay, it was decided that P4U was proposing to dismiss as redundant 20 or more staff at its head office and at its store at Merry Hill Shopping Centre ("Merry Hill"). However, it was not proposing to dismiss as redundant 20 or more employees at any other establishment; namely at retail stores. As a consequence, a large number of claims pursued by employees assigned to retail stores other than Merry Hill were struck out.
- 6) At the telephone case management hearing before me, on 28 September 2016, it was agreed that in the light of the first respondent's withdrawal of its legal representation as well as the suspension of an active defence of the claims<sup>1</sup> it

---

<sup>1</sup> It's response and grounds of resistance remain in the pleadings however.

was wholly proportionate for the tribunal to deal with the outstanding claims on the papers. I made further directions for case management prior to my determination, which were executed by the parties or their representatives.

### **Material findings of fact**

- 7) The P4U business model was largely built on negotiating ongoing contracts with networks such as O2, Vodafone and EE. Underlying P4U's downfall was the decision of all three networks to terminate their contractual relationships with the company.
- 8) P4U lost its O2 contract in February 2014.
- 9) On 6 August 2014 Vodafone gave notice to P4U of their intention not to renew their network relationship which was lost by reason of an exclusive contract given by Vodafone to Carphone Warehouse. The loss of Vodafone some 6 months only after the loss of O2 was a serious problem for P4U. It is probable that by that point senior management was considering redundancies, since P4U had become entirely dependent on the contract with EE. But it was inevitable that EE would follow suit.
- 10) On 12 September 2014, EE intimated that it would not be renewing its contract with P4U on 12 September 2014. Even without that however it is probable that P4U would not have survived with EE alone.
- 11) In the wake of the departure of EE from 12 September 2014, P4U made no attempts to consult with its employees about ways of avoiding redundancies, reducing the number of redundancies or mitigating the consequences.
- 12) It is probable that some plan to dismiss employees as redundant had been formulated during the period 7 August 2014 to 1 September 2014. following the notice by Vodafone to terminate its contract and the failure of further negotiations.
- 13) There was no recognised trade union nor was there any pre-existing representative forum. To comply with the duty to consult under s.188 appropriate representatives must have been elected before the first of the dismissals took effect. There cannot have been a valid election of employee representatives after the first of the dismissals took effect.
- 14) Kenny Campbell, whose statement I have read states that on 25 September 2014 he received a call from HR requesting that his team nominate a representative. Asked if it was part of a legal consultation process he was told it was not but purely for the purposes of the administrators having one representative to deal with.
- 15) Such representatives who were appointed in this manner were not the product of a proper election process and cannot be deemed appropriate representatives consistently with s.188.
- 16) There is no evidence of 'special circumstances' that are relied upon by P4U.

- 17) In relation to at least two of the claimants, James Hope (1306803/2014) and Emily Curtis (4118651/2014), there were resignations from their employment. Having regard to s.19(1) TULRCA I must determine whether such claimants resigned unreasonably. I am satisfied that there were good reasons for their resignations following the announcement that P4U had entered into administration. Those claimants left to take up stable employment; and indeed efforts to find other employment was encouraged by P4U.

### Relevant Law

- 18) The main relevant provisions of TULRCA (as amended, most recently with effect on 6 April 2013) are as follows: -

*s. 188 (1): Where an employer is proposing to dismiss as redundant 20 or more employees at one establishment within a period of 90 days or less, the employer shall consult about the dismissals all persons who are appropriate representatives of any of the employees who may be affected by the proposed dismissals or may be affected by measures taken in connection with those dismissals.*

*s. 188 (1A): The consultation shall begin in good time and in any event-*

*(a) where the employer is proposing to dismiss 100 or more employees as mentioned in subsection (1), at least 45 days, and*

*(b) otherwise, at least 30 days,*

*before the first of the dismissals takes effect.*

*s. 188 (1B): For the purposes of this section, the appropriate representatives of any affected employees are-*

*(a) if the employees are of a description in respect of which an independent trade union is recognised, representatives of that trade union, or*

*(b) in any other case, whichever of the following employee representatives the employer chooses: -*

*(i) employee representatives appointed or elected by the affected employees otherwise than for the purposes of this section, who (having regard to the purposes for and the method by which they were appointed or elected) have authority from those employees to receive information and to be consulted about the proposed dismissals on their behalf;*

*(ii) employee representatives elected by the affected employees, for the purpose of this section, in an election satisfying the requirements of section 188A (1).*

s. 188 (2): *The consultation shall include consultation about ways of-*

*(a) avoiding the dismissals,*

*(b) reducing the numbers of employees to be dismissed, and*

*(c) mitigating the consequences of the dismissals,*

*and shall be undertaken by the employer with a view to reaching agreement with the appropriate representatives.*

*[The following provisions deal with what consultation entails]*

*s. 188 (7): If in any case there are special circumstances which render it not reasonably practicable for the employer to comply with a requirement of subsection (1A), (2) or (4), the employer shall take all such steps towards compliance with that requirement as are reasonably practicable in those circumstances. Where the decision leading to the proposed dismissals is that of a person controlling the employer (directly or indirectly) a failure on the part of that person to provide information to the employer shall not constitute special circumstances rendering it not reasonably practicable for the employer to comply with such a requirement.*

*s. 188A The requirements for the election of employee representatives under section 188 (1B) (b) (ii) are that –*

*(a) the employer shall make such arrangements as are reasonably practical to ensure that the election is fair;*

*[(b to (h) make detailed provision for the elections, including secret voting and accurate counting of votes].”*

19) As to who may bring a complaint pursuant to s. 188 or 188A to an Employment Tribunal, s.189(1) TULRCA states: -

*“(a) in the case of a failure relating to the election of employee representatives, by any of the affected employees or by any of the employees who have been dismissed as redundant;*

*(b) in the case of any other failure relating to employee representatives, by any of the employee representatives to whom the failure related,*

*(c) in the case of failure relating to representatives of a trade union, by the trade union, and*

*(d) in any other case, by any of the affected employees or by any of the employees who have been dismissed as redundant.”*

20) I have considered *Independent Insurance Co Limited v Aspinall* [2011] IRLR 716 and the earlier decision of the Court of Appeal in *Northgate v Mercy* [2008] IRLR 222. I am satisfied that neither a recognised union nor employee representatives

were in place and that this complaint thus falls within s.189(1)(a) (or failing that (d)).

- 21) Thus the employees have standing to make claims and indeed as *Aspinall* makes clear, individually they must do so within the statutory time limit in order to bring a claim. That time limit is set out within s.189 (5): -

*“An employment tribunal shall not consider a complaint under this section unless it is presented to the tribunal—*

*(a) before the date on which the last of the dismissals to which the complaint relates takes effect, or*

*(b) during the period of three months beginning with that date, or*

*(c) where the tribunal is satisfied that it was not reasonably practicable for the complaint to be presented during the period of three months, within such further period as it considers reasonable.*

### **Application of Law to the Facts**

- 22) I have considered the files relating to the claims lodged. I have also considered the correspondence from the various parties. I have considered the bundles of documents produced on behalf of the claimants, which bundles extend to some 600 pages.
- 23) There were written witness statements of individual claimants who are part of the groups of claimants represented by Mr Kindell, of Morrish Solicitors and by Mr Doughty.
- 24) In relation to the 15 cases listed by Mr Doughty, which are said to have been dismissed in error, the records and files of the tribunal confirm that only the duplicate claims were withdrawn. Accordingly, all the individual claimants shown in the schedule at Part 2 of the Annex are part of the active claimants' schedule and are therefore entitled to an award by virtue of this judgment. Part 3 of the Annex lists the individual dates of redundancy. A full digital copy of the list accompanies the Judgment.
- 25) The ET3 and Grounds of Resistance of the second respondent (SoS) were presented to the tribunal on 21 March 2016. The SoS could not comment on the extent to which when proposing to make 20 or more employees redundant, the first respondent (P4U) failed to consult representatives of the affected employees. The SoS submitted that if after consideration of the facts, the tribunal was of the opinion that the claims involved employees at multiple establishments, those claimants who worked at establishments where the proposal to dismiss as redundant affected fewer than 20 employees, were not entitled to any protective award. The SoS position was that there were only two sites with 20 or more employees; the head office with approximately 1069 employees and the Merry Hill store with 21 employees. The SoS submitted that claims from the employees of the remaining stores, all of which had less than 20 employees, should be dismissed.

- 26) There is no argument before me that the claimants were not dismissed or that their roles were redundant within TULRCA s. 195 (1) and I note the effect of s. 195 (2), that where an employee is or is proposed to be dismissed, it shall be presumed, unless the contrary is proved, that he is or is proposed to be dismissed as redundant.
- 27) I accept the written evidence of the witnesses that there was no attempt to consult with them or to elect representatives to enable such consultation to take place. No suggestion has been made that there were special circumstances that rendered such consultation not reasonably practicable, or which mitigate against the failure to do so. I note pursuant to s.189(6) that the burden lies on the employer to show there were special circumstances and that he did take such steps as were reasonably practicable.
- 28) I am satisfied that the respondent failed to comply with its obligation to consult in section 188 and in order to allow such consultation to take place failed to elect representatives in accordance with section 188A.
- 29) Accordingly, I find the complaint well founded. By virtue of s. 189(2) in such circumstances I may make a protective award. If I do the statute provides as follows: -

“(4) The protected period –

*(a) begins with the date on which the first of the dismissals to which the complaint relates takes effect, or the date of the award, whichever is the earlier, and*

*(b) is of such length as the tribunal determines to be just and equitable in all the circumstances having regard to the seriousness of the employer’s default in complying with the requirement of section 188;*

*but shall not exceed 90 days.”*

- 30) Accordingly, the protected period here commences on 19 September 2014. As to the length of the protected period, Peter Gibson LJ in the Court of Appeal in Susie Radin Limited v GMB and Others [2004] IRLR 400 [45] gave the following guidance: -

*“I suggest that ETs, in deciding in the exercise of their discretion whether to make a protective award and for what period, should have the following matters in mind:*

*(1) The purpose of the award is to provide a sanction for breach by the employer of the obligations in s.188: it is not to compensate the employees for loss which they have suffered in consequence of the breach.*

*(2) The ET have a wide discretion to do what is just and equitable in all the circumstances, but the focus should be on the seriousness of the employer’s default.*

*(3) The default may vary in seriousness from the technical to a complete failure to provide any of the required information and to consult.*

*(4) The deliberateness of the failure may be relevant, as may the availability to the employer of legal advice about his obligations under s.188.*

*(5) How the ET assesses the length of the protected period is a matter for the ET, but a proper approach in a case where there has been no consultation is to start with the maximum period and reduce it only if there are mitigating circumstances justifying a reduction to an extent which the ET consider appropriate.”*

## **Conclusion**

- 31) In my judgment there was no consultation or attempt to comply with the provisions in this case; no mitigating factors are advanced. The starting point for the assessment of the protective award is the maximum, 90 days, and whilst I have a wide discretion to do what is just and equitable, in the absence of any evidence that points to the employer attempting to comply with its obligations or any mitigating circumstances, I conclude there are no grounds for me to reduce the same and the protective award shall therefore be the maximum of 90 days.

Employment Judge Lloyd

Dated: 11 January 2017

Judgment sent to Parties on

\_\_13 January 2017\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

**NOTE:** A statement is given under Regulation 5 (2) (b) of the Employment Protection (Recoupment of Jobseeker’s Allowance and Income Support) Regulations 1996 (“the Regulations”) and advises the respondent/s of its duties under regulation 6, and of the effect of Regulations 7 and 8, of the Regulations.



**ANNEX TO THE JUDGMENT (PART 1) (A) & (B) BEGINS ON PAGE 10**  
**(active claimants & issue fee paid by each fee group)**

**ANNEX TO THE JUDGMENT (PART 2) BEGINS ON PAGE 19**  
**(withdrawn but duplicate claims)**

**ANNEX TO THE JUDGMENT (PART 3) BEGINS ON PAGE 20**  
**(List of dates of redundancy)**

**ANNEX (PART 1)(A)**

<b>Case Number</b>	<b>Claimant Name</b>	<b>Representative</b>	<b>Fee Group</b>
1302198/2015	Ms Susan Lowey	Susan Lowey	1
1302199/2015	Mr Sean Ryan	Susan Lowey	1
1302200/2015	Mrs Teresa Harford	Susan Lowey	1
1302201/2015	Mr Iain Finlay	Susan Lowey	1
1302202/2015	Miss Nichola Aubrey	Susan Lowey	1
1302203/2015	Miss Anna Foster	Susan Lowey	1
1302204/2015	Mrs Elizabeth German	Susan Lowey	1
1302205/2015	Miss Lisa Woodward	Susan Lowey	1
1302206/2015	Mrs Laura Abbott	Susan Lowey	1
1302207/2015	Miss Katie McShane	Susan Lowey	1
1306072/2014	Mr Andrew Doughty	Andrew Doughty	2
1306073/2014	Ms Danielle Thornhill	Andrew Doughty	2
1306074/2014	Mr Carl Palin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306075/2014	Ms Kirsty Lear	Andrew Doughty	2
1306076/2014	Ms Corrina Cook	Andrew Doughty	2
1306077/2014	Mr Ian Kimble	Andrew Doughty	2
1306079/2014	Ms Charlene Gentile	Andrew Doughty	2
1306080/2014	Mr Ian Cassidy	Andrew Doughty	2
1306087/2014	Mr Balvinder Hayer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306088/2014	Mr James Roberts	Andrew Doughty	2
1306089/2014	Mr Simon Rowson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306090/2014	Ms Kayleigh Barnett	Andrew Doughty	2
1306093/2014	Ms Shona Sparks	Andrew Doughty	2
1306095/2014	Mr Matthew Galletley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306100/2014	Mr Tim Price	Andrew Doughty	2
1306101/2014	Mr Paul Green	Andrew Doughty	2
1306103/2014	Ms Collette Morgan	Andrew Doughty	2
1306104/2014	Mr Mark Hudson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306106/2014	Mr Daniel Heard	Andrew Doughty	2
1306107/2014	Mr Kristian Peake	Andrew Doughty	2
1306108/2014	Ms Kay Kimble	Andrew Doughty	2
1306110/2014	Mr Max Jennings	Andrew Doughty	2
1306111/2014	Ms Louise Collett	Andrew Doughty	2
1306112/2014	Mrs Andrea Harper	Andrew Doughty	2
1306114/2014	Ms Kellie Dale	Andrew Doughty	2
1306115/2014	Mr Steven Clarke	Andrew Doughty	2
1306116/2014	Ms Katie Unsted	Andrew Doughty	2
1306117/2014	Mr Mark Ennis	Andrew Doughty	2
1306118/2014	Ms Gemma Johnston	Andrew Doughty	2
1306119/2014	Mr Tim Hickman	Andrew Doughty	2
1306121/2014	Ms Dawn Walley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306123/2014	Mr Christopher Lawton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306124/2014	Mr Michael Wallace	Andrew Doughty	2
1306125/2014	Mr Calum Murphy	Andrew Doughty	2
1306127/2014	Ms Kate Asher	Andrew Doughty	2
1306129/2014	Ms Andrea Hall	Andrew Doughty	2
1306130/2014	Ms Tina Morton	Andrew Doughty	2

1306132/2014	Ms Amy Glover	Andrew Doughty	2
1306133/2014	Ms Vanessa Brown	Andrew Doughty	2
1306134/2014	Ms Larissa Evans	Andrew Doughty	2
1306135/2014	Ms Alexandra Pawezowski	Andrew Doughty	2
1306136/2014	Ms Dawn Ramsay	Andrew Doughty	2
1306139/2014	Ms Emma Seamark	Andrew Doughty	2
1306141/2014	Mr Paul Pyrgoudes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306147/2014	Ms Faiza Akhtar	Andrew Doughty	2
1306154/2014	Ms Liz Collins	Andrew Doughty	2
1306155/2014	Mr John Parry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306156/2014	Mr Daniel Elmore	Andrew Doughty	2
1306157/2014	Ms Hayley Bowers	Andrew Doughty	2
1306162/2014	Mr Luke Foster	Andrew Doughty	2
1306165/2014	Ms Kimberley Griffiths	Andrew Doughty	2
1306166/2014	Ms Karen Pritchard	Andrew Doughty	2
1306171/2014	Mr David Thompson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306173/2014	Ms Samantha Gibbs	Andrew Doughty	2
1306175/2014	Ms Simona Navickaite	Andrew Doughty	2
1306176/2014	Mr Dominic Brice	Andrew Doughty	2
1306177/2014	Ms Andrea Shore	Andrew Doughty	2
1306182/2014	Mr Lee Warren	Andrew Doughty	2
1306183/2014	Mr Martin Charlesworth	Andrew Doughty	2
1306184/2014	Ms Kerry Roberts	Andrew Doughty	2
1306187/2014	Mr Stephen Flynn	Andrew Doughty	2
1306188/2014	Ms Johanna Gordon	Andrew Doughty	2
1306193/2014	Mr David Lewis	Andrew Doughty	2
1306194/2014	Ms Melanie Dixon	Andrew Doughty	2
1306195/2014	Ms Kelly Whitaker	Andrew Doughty	2
1306196/2014	Ms Victoria Podmore	Daniel Kindell	2
1306200/2014	Ms Susan Sumner	Andrew Doughty	2
1306202/2014	Mr Adam Coll	Andrew Doughty	2
1306203/2014	Mr Martin Donnelly	Andrew Doughty	2
1306204/2014	Mr Donovan Molloy	Andrew Doughty	2
1306206/2014	Ms Janet Perry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306207/2014	Ms Daniela Soares	Andrew Doughty	2
1306208/2014	Ms Leanne Jones	Andrew Doughty	2
1306215/2014	Mr James Price	Andrew Doughty	2
1306216/2014	Ms Jane Ferris	Andrew Doughty	2
1306220/2014	Ms Katrina Andrews	Andrew Doughty	2
1306221/2014	Mr Aaron Clewlow	Andrew Doughty	2
1306222/2014	Ms Kaylee Caldwell	Andrew Doughty	2
1306223/2014	Ms Victoria Caines	Andrew Doughty	2
1306226/2014	Ms Samantha Condliffe	Andrew Doughty	2
1306227/2014	Ms Sarah Perry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306228/2014	Mr Simon Wade	Andrew Doughty	2
1306230/2014	Mr David Tobin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306234/2014	Mr Lloyd Simpson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306235/2014	Ms Catherine Herod	Andrew Doughty	2
1306237/2014	Ms Amy Bott	Andrew Doughty	2

1306238/2014	Ms Danielle Woodall	Andrew Doughty	2
1306241/2014	Mr Patrick Hanley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306242/2014	Mr Wayne Smyth	Andrew Doughty	2
1306243/2014	Mr Zoran Krbacevic	Andrew Doughty	2
1306245/2014	Mr Robert Cunningham	Andrew Doughty	2
1306250/2014	Ms Sophie Hollis	Andrew Doughty	2
1306251/2014	Ms Rhian Adams	Andrew Doughty	2
1306252/2014	Mr Thomas Allen	Andrew Doughty	2
1306254/2014	Mr Christopher Thurbin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306255/2014	Mr Richard Jenkins	Andrew Doughty	2
1306258/2014	Ms Francesca Dunne	Andrew Doughty	2
1306260/2014	Mr Russell Bettany	Andrew Doughty	2
1306261/2014	Mr Steven Ware	Andrew Doughty	2
1306264/2014	Ms Sian Corbett	Andrew Doughty	2
1306266/2014	Mr Paul Davies	Andrew Doughty	2
1306267/2014	Ms Rebecca Tirrell	Andrew Doughty	2
1306268/2014	Mr Carl Stephens	Andrew Doughty	2
1306270/2014	Ms Glenda Jones	Andrew Doughty	2
1306272/2014	Mr Donald Black	Andrew Doughty	2
1306273/2014	Ms Claire Gough-Rhodes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306274/2014	Ms Sarah Peach	Andrew Doughty	2
1306276/2014	Mr Roger Goswell	Andrew Doughty	2
1306279/2014	Mr Rowan Walmsley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306280/2014	Mr Daniel Mellings	Andrew Doughty	2
1306281/2014	Ms Jacqueline Sethna	Andrew Doughty	2
1306283/2014	Mr Jason Green	Andrew Doughty	2
1306290/2014	Ms Kerry Lenherr	Andrew Doughty	2
1306294/2014	Mr Ben Epstein	Andrew Doughty	2
1306296/2014	Mr Rupert Topp	Andrew Doughty	2
1306297/2014	Mr Richard Jennings	Andrew Doughty	2
1306298/2014	Mr Andrew Ratcliffe	Andrew Doughty	2
1306300/2014	Ms Zakariya Mamaniat	Andrew Doughty	2
1306303/2014	Ms Lisa Heaps	Andrew Doughty	2
1306305/2014	Mr Ricky Turpin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306309/2014	Ms Christine Broughall	Andrew Doughty	2
1306310/2014	Mr Lawrence Davis	Andrew Doughty	2
1306312/2014	Ms Carina Ratcliffe	Andrew Doughty	2
1306313/2014	Ms Alexis Kudlek	Andrew Doughty	2
1306314/2014	Ms Rebecca Harp	Andrew Doughty	2
1306315/2014	Ms Janet Mason	Andrew Doughty	2
1306316/2014	Mr David Cartlidge	Andrew Doughty	2
1306318/2014	Ms Victoria Stewart	Andrew Doughty	2
1306319/2014	Ms Yohannes Ghebrewoldi	Andrew Doughty	2
1306320/2014	Mr James Parker	Andrew Doughty	2
1306321/2014	Mr Dale Teece	Andrew Doughty	2
1306322/2014	Ms Jane James	Andrew Doughty	2
1306324/2014	Mr David Rigby	Andrew Doughty	2
1306325/2014	Mr John Pew	Andrew Doughty	2
1306326/2014	Ms Gemma Murphy	Andrew Doughty	2

1306330/2014	Mr Matthew Rowley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306334/2014	Mr Adam Lawton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306335/2014	Mr Chris Limer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306337/2014	Mr Kristiyan Ivanov	Andrew Doughty	2
1306338/2014	Mr Nigel Cutler	Andrew Doughty	2
1306340/2014	Ms Karen Jayne Roberts	Andrew Doughty	2
1306343/2014	Mr Roger Barnett	Andrew Doughty	2
1306346/2014	Mr Dean Capehorn	Andrew Doughty	2
1306347/2014	Mr Robert McKechnie	Andrew Doughty	2
1306350/2014	Mr Steven Lawton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306351/2014	Mr Elliot Foster	Andrew Doughty	2
1306352/2014	Ms Emma Morris	Andrew Doughty	2
1306353/2014	Mr Paul Naylor	Andrew Doughty	2
1306356/2014	Mrs Chloe Park	Andrew Doughty	2
1306358/2014	Ms Leah Thompson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306360/2014	Mr Ian Pettitt	Andrew Doughty	2
1306369/2014	Mr Andrew Oliver	Andrew Doughty	2
1306370/2014	Mr William Baskeyfield	Andrew Doughty	2
1306372/2014	Ms Joanne Louise Davies	Andrew Doughty	2
1306374/2014	Ms Corrine Bolam	Andrew Doughty	2
1306375/2014	Mr Mark Kershaw	Andrew Doughty	2
1306376/2014	Mr Andrew Washington	Andrew Doughty	2
1306378/2014	Mr Matthew Wilks	Andrew Doughty	2
1306379/2014	Mr Matt Stanton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306382/2014	Mr Mark Wasley	Andrew Doughty	2
1306385/2014	Mr Paul Aldridge	Andrew Doughty	2
1306387/2014	Mr Mark Wilkinson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306389/2014	Mr Thomas Cooke	Andrew Doughty	2
1306392/2014	Ms Stacey Simpson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306396/2014	Mr Philip Dobson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306397/2014	Mr Ryan Cartern	Andrew Doughty	2
1306398/2014	Mr Rhys Doyl	Andrew Doughty	2
1306400/2014	Mr James Dunning	Andrew Doughty	2
1306403/2014	Ms Amy Richards	Andrew Doughty	2
1306404/2014	Ms Louis Emery	Andrew Doughty	2
1306405/2014	Mr Mark Prinold	Andrew Doughty	2
1306407/2014	Miss Sophie Louise Hughes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306409/2014	Mr Andy Mayer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306410/2014	Mr Robert Vernon	Andrew Doughty	2
1306411/2014	Mr Jonny Malpass	Andrew Doughty	2
1306413/2014	Mr Jamie Carey	Andrew Doughty	2
1306414/2014	Ms Kathryn Mear	Andrew Doughty	2
1306415/2014	Ms Nicola Kinsey	Andrew Doughty	2
1306417/2014	Mr Toby Hand	Andrew Doughty	2
1306418/2014	Ms Amy <b>Warsop</b>	Andrew Doughty	2
1306419/2014	Mr Luke Burrows	Andrew Doughty	2
1306420/2014	Ms Gemma Shaw	Andrew Doughty	2
1306422/2014	Ms Nicola Eldershaw	Andrew Doughty	2
1306423/2014	Ms Hayley Coates	Andrew Doughty	2

1306424/2014	Ms Leesa Edwards	Andrew Doughty	2
1306425/2014	Mr Azeem Ahmad	Andrew Doughty	2
1306426/2014	Ms Susan Bloor	Andrew Doughty	2
1306427/2014	Mr Matthew Hancock	Andrew Doughty	2
1306428/2014	Ms Gayle Bradshaw	Andrew Doughty	2
1306430/2014	Ms Felicity Broadgate	Andrew Doughty	2
1306431/2014	Mr Oliver Masters	Andrew Doughty	2
1306433/2014	Mr Paul Cooper	Andrew Doughty	2
1306434/2014	Ms Hannah Huxley-Greene	Andrew Doughty	2
1306436/2014	Mr Jack Totton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306437/2014	Mr Nicholas Allen	Andrew Doughty	2
1306438/2014	Mr Dominic McGarry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306439/2014	Mr Ashley Berry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306440/2014	Ms Lucy Cranson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306442/2014	Ms Suzanne Cope	Andrew Doughty	2
1306443/2014	Ms Bebiana Greenwood	Andrew Doughty	2
1306444/2014	Ms Fiona Peck	Andrew Doughty	2
1306446/2014	Mr Jason Dalgarno	Andrew Doughty	2
1306447/2014	Ms Nicola Cottrell	Andrew Doughty	2
1306448/2014	Ms Catriona Sinclair	Andrew Doughty	2
1306451/2014	Ms Joanne Bradbury	Andrew Doughty	2
1306452/2014	Ms Rebecca Johnson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306456/2014	Ms Kerry Wint	Andrew Doughty	2
1306457/2014	Ms Laura Hanks	Andrew Doughty	2
1306458/2014	Ms Shiu Kum Lok	Andrew Doughty	2
1306459/2014	Mr Jon Twigg	Andrew Doughty	2
1306460/2014	Mr Richard Poskitt	Andrew Doughty	2
1306461/2014	Ms Sophie Quinn	Andrew Doughty	2
1306463/2014	Mr Lee Grant	Andrew Doughty	2
1306464/2014	Ms Susan Blakemore	Andrew Doughty	2
1306466/2014	Ms Emma Reynolds	Andrew Doughty	2
1306468/2014	Ms Emma Dechoux	Andrew Doughty	2
1306469/2014	Mr James Goodman	Andrew Doughty	2
1306470/2014	Ms Jemma Palmer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306472/2014	Mr Ryan Lewis	Andrew Doughty	2
1306473/2014	Mr Richard Dawson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306474/2014	Mr Stephen Goodwin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306475/2014	Mr Dayne Ralston	Andrew Doughty	2
1306477/2014	Ms Stacy Goodwin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306478/2014	Mr Christopher Walton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306479/2014	Ms Helen Marie Jones	Andrew Doughty	2
1306480/2014	Ms Angela McGreal	Andrew Doughty	2
1306483/2014	Mr Ben Carpenter	Andrew Doughty	2
1306484/2014	Ms Lyndsey Spencer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306485/2014	Ms Joanne Rowe	Andrew Doughty	2
1306486/2014	Ms Dawn Henderson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306487/2014	Mr David Adams	Andrew Doughty	2
1306488/2014	Ms Emma Tideswell	Andrew Doughty	2
1306491/2014	Ms Samantha Wright	Andrew Doughty	2

1306493/2014	Mr David Mountfield	Andrew Doughty	2
1306494/2014	Mr Lee Palmer	Andrew Doughty	2
1306497/2014	Mr Stuart Whelan	Andrew Doughty	2
1306498/2014	Ms Diane Cripps-Brodie	Andrew Doughty	2
1306501/2014	Mr Darren Humphreys	Andrew Doughty	2
1306504/2014	Mr Edward Deane	Andrew Doughty	2
1306512/2014	Mr John-Daniel Whyte	Andrew Doughty	2
1306513/2014	Mr Andrew Bailey	Andrew Doughty	2
1306518/2014	Ms Nicola Twigg	Andrew Doughty	2
1306519/2014	Mr Muhammad Ziad Afzal	Andrew Doughty	2
1306522/2014	Mr Robert Crank	Andrew Doughty	2
1306523/2014	Mr Anil Patel	Andrew Doughty	2
1306526/2014	Ms Zoe Parkes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306527/2014	Ms Natasha Leighs	Andrew Doughty	2
1306529/2014	Ms Jemma Ayre	Andrew Doughty	2
1306530/2014	Ms Laura Jankowski	Andrew Doughty	2
1306538/2014	Mr Andrew Maddock	Andrew Doughty	2
1306540/2014	Mr Ian Brownrigg	Andrew Doughty	2
1306542/2014	Ms Gillian Lockett	Andrew Doughty	2
1306545/2014	Ms Ria McDonald-Roberts	Andrew Doughty	2
1306547/2014	Ms Christie Lawrenec	Andrew Doughty	2
1306549/2014	Mr Chris Wood	Andrew Doughty	2
1306550/2014	Mr Lee Daughtry	Andrew Doughty	2
1306552/2014	Ms Stacey Webb	Andrew Doughty	2
1306553/2014	Mr Andrew Deaville	Andrew Doughty	2
1306554/2014	Mr Jonathan Bowman	Andrew Doughty	2
1306556/2014	Mr Ashley Stevens	Andrew Doughty	2
1306557/2014	Mr Ian Pace	Andrew Doughty	2
1306562/2014	Ms Nicolle-Marie Bryan	Andrew Doughty	2
1306565/2014	Mr Paul Fairhurst	Andrew Doughty	2
1306567/2014	Ms Emma Clowes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306573/2014	Ms Kathryn Stimpson	Andrew Doughty	2
1306575/2014	Mrs Gemma <b>Barlow</b>	Andrew Doughty	2
1306576/2014	Ms Yasmin Hussain	Andrew Doughty	2
1306579/2014	Ms Rebecca Hopkin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306582/2014	Ms Jennifer Heyes	Andrew Doughty	2
1306585/2014	Ms Nicola Tombs	Andrew Doughty	2
1306586/2014	Mr Steven Proctor	Andrew Doughty	2
1306591/2014	Mr Gary Ellwood	Andrew Doughty	2
1306592/2014	Mr Jagjit Matharu	Andrew Doughty	2
1306593/2014	Ms Laura McGeachin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306596/2014	Mr Michael McGeachin	Andrew Doughty	2
1306600/2014	Mr Ahsan Saeed Khan	Andrew Doughty	2
1306605/2014	Ms Chelsea Lehane-Aston	Andrew Doughty	2
1306606/2014	Mr Michael Middleton	Andrew Doughty	2
1306608/2014	Mr Darren Williams	Andrew Doughty	2
1306611/2014	Ms Katie Beardmore	Andrew Doughty	2
1306613/2014	Ms Stephanie Wright	Andrew Doughty	2
1306617/2014	Ms Sarah Walton	Andrew Doughty	2

1306618/2014	Mr Mathew Burndred	Andrew Doughty	2
1306622/2014	Mr Paul O'Mahoney	Andrew Doughty	2
1306623/2014	Ms Julie Griffiths	Andrew Doughty	2
1306624/2014	Ms Rebekah Belhadjaissa	Andrew Doughty	2
1306625/2014	Miss Nicola James	Andrew Doughty	2
1306626/2014	Ms Lisa Tidmarsh	Andrew Doughty	2
1306627/2014	Mr David Shaw	Andrew Doughty	2
1306628/2014	Ms Laura Monks	Andrew Doughty	2
1306631/2014	Mr Kevin Yates	Andrew Doughty	2
1306633/2014	Ms Amy Tams	Andrew Doughty	2
1306634/2014	Ms Riva Arnold	Andrew Doughty	2
1306635/2014	Ms Nicola Sale	Andrew Doughty	2
1306638/2014	Ms Katie Hoskins	Andrew Doughty	2
1306639/2014	Mr Daniel Taylor	Andrew Doughty	2
1306645/2014	Ms Joanna Humphries	Andrew Doughty	2
1306647/2014	Mrs Laura French	Andrew Doughty	2
1306648/2014	Mr Chris French	Andrew Doughty	2
1306649/2014	Mrs Deborah Vickers	Andrew Doughty	2
1306651/2014	Mr Anthony Navaie-Bryan	Andrew Doughty	2
1306652/2014	Ms Jitka Campbell	Daniel Kindell	2
1306653/2014	Mr Daniel Hall	Andrew Doughty	2
1306710/2014	Mr Muhammad Afzal	Daniel Kindell	3
1306713/2014	Mr Mohammad Neezam Ali	Daniel Kindell	3
1306714/2014	Mr Mohammed Alshariff Alshammam	Daniel Kindell	3
1306716/2014	Mr Michael Asante	Daniel Kindell	3
1306717/2014	Miss Madeeha Asif	Daniel Kindell	3
1306719/2014	Ms Joanne Beech	Daniel Kindell	3
1306723/2014	Mr Greg Blair	Daniel Kindell	3
1306726/2014	Mr Ryan Brunetti	Daniel Kindell	3
1306727/2014	Mr Luke Butler	Daniel Kindell	3
1306729/2014	Mr Robert Carlin	Daniel Kindell	3
1306730/2014	Mr Matthew Carnall	Daniel Kindell	3
1306734/2014	Mr Kyle Cassidy	Daniel Kindell	3
1306739/2014	Mr Chisala Chiyungi	Daniel Kindell	3
1306746/2014	Mr Simon Copeland	Daniel Kindell	3
1306747/2014	Mr Robert Coulson	Daniel Kindell	3
1306750/2014	Miss Gemma Crane	Daniel Kindell	3
1306755/2014	Miss Tracy De-Ath	Daniel Kindell	3
1306761/2014	Miss Giovanna Eaton	Daniel Kindell	3
1306762/2014	Mr Abbas Ebrahimi	Daniel Kindell	3
1306766/2014	Mr Paul Everitt	Daniel Kindell	3
1306769/2014	Miss Amy Fegan	Daniel Kindell	3
1306771/2014	Miss Melissa Finikin	Daniel Kindell	3
1306781/2014	Miss Lucy Gratton	Daniel Kindell	3
1306789/2014	Mr Gary Hall	Daniel Kindell	3
1306790/2014	Mrs Sarah Hall	Daniel Kindell	3
1306793/2014	Mr Martin Hand	Daniel Kindell	3
1306796/2014	Miss Joanne Harman	Daniel Kindell	3
1306798/2014	Mr Anthony Heeley	Daniel Kindell	3
1306800/2014	Mr Daniel Hewitt	Daniel Kindell	3



1306803/2014	Mr James Hope	Daniel Kindell	3
1306805/2014	Mr Simon Hughes	Daniel Kindell	3
1306806/2014	Mr Jamie Hughes	Daniel Kindell	3
1306812/2014	Mr Matthew Johnson	Daniel Kindell	3
1306813/2014	Mr Matthew Jones	Daniel Kindell	3
1306815/2014	Mr Michael Jones	Daniel Kindell	3
1306816/2014	Miss Louise Jones	Daniel Kindell	3
1306817/2014	Miss Lauren Keele	Daniel Kindell	3
1306819/2014	Mr Stephen Kelly	Daniel Kindell	3
1306821/2014	Mr Umar Khurshid	Daniel Kindell	3
1306822/2014	Mr Carl Kirkland	Daniel Kindell	3
1306825/2014	Mr Jamie Latham	Daniel Kindell	3
1306827/2014	Miss Laura Lloyd	Daniel Kindell	3
1306829/2014	Miss Lauren Lovatt	Daniel Kindell	3
1306833/2014	Miss Yasmin Mahmood	Daniel Kindell	3
1306835/2014	Mr Paul Matthews	Daniel Kindell	3
1306842/2014	Mr Daniel Melia	Daniel Kindell	3
1306847/2014	Mr Usman Nazir	Daniel Kindell	3
1306852/2014	Miss Carly Oliver	Daniel Kindell	3
1306855/2014	Mr Alan Parr	Daniel Kindell	3
1306857/2014	Miss Lauren Phillips	Daniel Kindell	3
1306859/2014	Mrs Sharon Porton	Daniel Kindell	3
1306865/2014	Miss Sarah Rafferty	Daniel Kindell	3
1306866/2014	Mr Paul Ridley	Daniel Kindell	3
1306868/2014	Mr Daniel Robinson	Daniel Kindell	3
1306869/2014	Miss Claire Rogers	Daniel Kindell	3
1306871/2014	Miss Kerri Rowan	Daniel Kindell	3
1306882/2014	Mrs Louise Smallwood	Daniel Kindell	3
1306883/2014	Mr Lee Smith	Daniel Kindell	3
1306901/2014	Mr Karl Walford	Daniel Kindell	3
1306902/2014	Mr Kelvin Walsh	Daniel Kindell	3
1306903/2014	Mr Aaron Ward	Daniel Kindell	3
1306911/2014	Mr Joseph Williams	Daniel Kindell	3
1306916/2014	Mr Christopher Wootley	Daniel Kindell	3
1306918/2014	Mr Thomas Wright	Daniel Kindell	3
1306919/2014	Mr Nicholas Wright	Daniel Kindell	3
1306920/2014	Miss Teri Wyatt	Daniel Kindell	3
1306971/2014	Mrs Melanie Choudhary	Daniel Kindell	4
1306973/2014	Mr Edward Lawrance	Mr Edward Lawrance	4
4118592/2014	Mr Craig Blain	Daniel Kindell	5
4118615/2014	O'Donnell N Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118616/2014	Mr Neil Garner	Daniel Kindell	5
4118617/2014	Ham M Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118618/2014	Ms Penny New	Daniel Kindell	5
4118619/2014	Ford-Hutchinson S Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118620/2014	Jackson A Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118621/2014	Mr Simon Wright	Daniel Kindell	5
4118622/2014	Gloria S Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118623/2014	Maxwell C Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118624/2014	Solanki D Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118625/2014	Mr Adam Greenhouse	Daniel Kindell	5

4118626/2014	Grant A Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118627/2014	Mr Martin Doyle	Daniel Kindell	5
4118628/2014	Connolly P Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118629/2014	Cowlin J Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118643/2014	Jennings H Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118644/2014	Moore L Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118645/2014	Egan S Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118646/2014	Ms Nicola Jayne Walsh	Daniel Kindell	5
4118647/2014	Beard KE Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118648/2014	Southern SH Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118649/2014	Taylor L Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118650/2014	Facciponti-Moore G Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118651/2014	Curtis EC Miss	Daniel Kindell	5
4118652/2014	Cox JA Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118653/2014	Perkin J Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118654/2014	Giles C Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118655/2014	Thomas M Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118656/2014	Von Waltsleben QG Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118725/2014	Speirs R Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118729/2014	Campbell K Mr	Daniel Kindell	5
4118730/2014	Thomson J Ms	Daniel Kindell	5
4118731/2014	Burr LR Mr	Daniel Kindell	5

**ANNEX (PART 1)(B)**

<b>Fee Group</b>	<b>Claim Submitted By</b>	<b>Date of Claim</b>	<b>Amount Paid (Issue Fee)</b>
1	Susan Lowey	16/04/2015	£500.00
2	Andrew Doughty	05/12/2014	£1,500.00
3	Morrish Solicitors LLP	11/12/2014	£1,500.00
4	Lee Smith	23/12/2014	£500.00
5	Gillian Campbell	15/12/2014	£1,000.00















**ANNEX (PART 2)**

**All 15 claimants shown in Annex (Part 2) remain active claimants. Claims dismissed on withdrawal were duplicate claims and those claimants have a live claim under the case number in the right hand column.**

<b>Case Number</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Fee Group</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>Duplicate Case Number</b>
1306082/2014	Ms Louise Smallwood		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306882/2014
1306148/2014	Ms Farhana Choudhury	2	Dismissed in error	None
1306197/2014	Ms Lauren Smith	2	Dismissed in error	None
1306219/2014	Ms Samantha Francis	2	Dismissed in error	None
1306240/2014	Mr Adam Jones	2	Dismissed in error	None
1306345/2014	Ms Lauren Keele		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306817/2014
1306395/2014	Ms Aaron Ward		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306903/2014
1306406/2014	Ms Sarah Hall		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306790/2014
1306408/2014	Mr Gary Hall		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306789/2014
1306490/2014	Ms Claire Rogers		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306869/2014
1306511/2014	Ms Joanne Beech		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306719/2014
1306543/2014	Ms Claire Maxwell		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 18/12/2015	4118623/2014
1306559/2014	Mr Mike Ham		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 18/12/2015	4118617/2014
1306610/2014	Mr Martin Doyle		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 18/12/2015	4118627/2014
1306642/2014	Mr Kelvin Walsh		Duplicate Claim - dismissed on Withdrawal on 21/12/2015	1306902/2014

## ANNEX PART 3

**List of redundancy dates prepared by the Administrators  
(The full digital files are attachments to the promulgating email)**

 Redundancy 30 Sep 14... 52 KB	 Redundancy 24 Oct 14... 44 KB
 Redundancy 22 Sep 14... 42 KB	 Redundancy 17 Oct 14... 44 KB
 Redundancy 15 Oct 14... 47 KB	 Redundancy 14 Nov 14... 43 KB
 Redundancy 14 Oct 14... 50 KB	 Redundancy 28 Nov 14... 43 KB
 Redundancy 19 Sep 14... 85 KB	 Leavers.pdf 47 KB
 Redundancy 10 Oct 14... 45 KB	 Redundancy 08 Dec 14... 42 KB
 Redundancy 31 Oct 14... 49 KB	 Redundancy 30 Nov 14... 42 KB